4 yearly review of modern awards - Award flexibility common issue AM2014/300

NATIONAL FARMERS' FEDERATION SUBMISSION ON PROPOSED MODEL TERM FOR TIME OFF IN LIEU OF OVERTIME

Date: 23 May 2016

- 1. The National Farmers' Federation (NFF) is the peak industry body representing Australian farmers and agribusiness across the supply chain, including all of Australia's major agricultural commodity groups.
- 2. On 24 April 2016, the Full Bench of the Fair Work Commission (**Commission**) issued its decision in *4 yearly review of modern awards—Common issue—Award Flexibility* [20164] FWCFB 2602 (**the decision**).
- 3. In the decision, the Commission determined a model time off in lieu of overtime (**TOIL**) term for insertion in the majority of modern awards.
- 4. On 9 May 2016, the Commission published a further 'plain English' draft model term for comment. This submission responds to the request for comments by 23 May 2016.

The statutory framework

- 5. Section 156 of Part 2-3 of the *Fair Work Act 2009* (**FW Act**) requires the Commission to conduct a 4 yearly review of modern awards. Each modern award must be reviewed in its own right.
- 6. In a 4 yearly review of modern awards, the Commission can make, vary and revoke modern awards (subsection 156(2)(b)).
- 7. A decision to make, vary or revoke a modern award under Part 2-3 of the FW Act can only be made if the Commission is satisfied that it is necessary to achieve the modern awards objective.

- 8. Section 134 of the FW Act contains the modern awards objective. Modern awards must provide a 'fair and relevant minimum safety net of terms and conditions' of employment, taking into account the following criteria:
 - a. relative living standards and the needs of the low paid (subsection 134(1)(a));
 - b. the need to encourage collective bargaining (subsection 134(1)(b));
 - c. the need to promote social inclusion through increased workforce participation (subsection 134(1)(c));
 - d. the need to promote flexible modern work practices and the efficient and productive performance of work (subsection 134(1)(d));
 - e. the need to provide additional remuneration for employees working overtime; unsocial, irregular or unpredictable hours; on weekends or public holidays; or shifts (subsection 134(1)(da));
 - f. the principle of equal remuneration for work of equal or comparable value (subsection 134(1)(e));
 - g. the likely impact of any exercise of modern award powers on business, including on productivity, employment costs and the regulatory burden (subsection 134(1)(f));
 - h. the need to ensure a simple, easy to understand, stable and sustainable modern award system for Australia that avoids unnecessary overlap of modern awards (subsection 134(1)(g)); and
 - i. the likely impact of any exercise of modern award powers on employment growth, inflation and the sustainability, performance and competitiveness of the national economy (subsection 134(1)(h)).
- 9. Under section 136, a modern award can only include terms that are permitted or required by:
 - a. Subdivision B of Part 2-3 (terms that may be included in modern awards)
 - b. Subdivision C of Part 2-3 (terms that must be included in modern awards)
 - c. Section 55 (interaction between the National Employment Standards (**NES**) and modern awards or enterprise agreements); or

- d. Part 2-2 (NES).
- 10. Section 138 of the FW Act provides for modern awards to include terms that are either permitted or required to be included, but only to the extent necessary to achieve the modern awards objective and the minimum wages objective.
- 11. Modern award terms must not exclude the NES, or any provision of the NES (subsection 55(1)).
- 12. Once a decision is made under Part 2-3 of the FW Act, it cannot be varied or revoked (section 603(3) of Part 5-1 of the FW Act).

The October model TOIL term

- 13. In a decision on 6 October 2016¹, the Full Bench determined the final version of the model TOIL term.
- 14. Attachment 3 to the Full Bench decision of 6 October 2015 set out the model TOIL term, as follows:

Attachment 3 – final version of the model TOIL term

1. Time off in lieu of payment for overtime

- 1.1 An employee may elect with the consent of the employer to take time off in lieu of payment for overtime at a time or times agreed with the employer, in accordance with this clause.
- 1.2 The following requirements apply to time off in lieu of payment for overtime:
- (a) A separate written agreement must be made by the employee and employer for each occasion on which overtime that has been worked is to be taken as time off in lieu. Each such agreement must be retained as an employee record and must:
- (i) state when the employee started and ceased working the overtime hours;
- (ii) state that the employee and employer agree that the employee may take time off in lieu of payment for the overtime; and
- (iii) include a note in the following terms:

'If requested by the employee at any time, the employer must pay the employee for any accrued entitlement to take time off in lieu of payment for overtime which the

-

¹ [2015] FWCFB 6847

employee has not yet used. Payment must be made at the overtime rate applying to the overtime worked and must be made in the next pay period following the request.'

- (b) Overtime taken as time off during ordinary time hours shall be taken at the ordinary time rate; that is, an hour for each overtime hour worked.
- (c) The time to be taken off in lieu of overtime must be agreed between the employee and employer and must be taken within six months of the overtime being worked. Otherwise, payment for the overtime must be made to the employee at overtime rates in the next pay period after that six month period.
- (d) Notwithstanding any other provision of clause 1.2, if requested by an employee at any time, the employer must pay the employee for any accrued entitlement to take time off in lieu of payment for overtime which the employee has not yet used. Payment must be made at the overtime rate applying to the overtime worked and must be made in the next pay period following the request for payment.
- (e) If, upon termination of employment, an employee has an accrued entitlement to take time off in lieu of payment for overtime which the employee has not yet used, the employee must be paid for the overtime at the overtime rate applying to the overtime worked.
- 1.3 An employee who is entitled to request a change in working arrangements under section 65 of the Fair Work Act 2009 may make a request under that section for time off in lieu of payment for overtime at a time or times specified in the request or at a time or times to be subsequently agreed with the employer. This clause will apply to such time off in lieu. Pursuant to section 65(5) of the Fair Work Act 2009, the employer may refuse such a request only on reasonable business grounds.
- 1.4 An employer must not exert undue influence or undue pressure on an employee in relation to a decision by the employee to make, or not make, an agreement to take time off in lieu of payment for overtime.

Note: Under s.345 of the Fair Work Act 2009, a person must not knowingly or recklessly make a false or misleading representation about an employee's workplace rights under this award clause.

15. Following further submissions, the Commission agreed to minor changes to the proposed model TOIL term so that one written agreement could cover a number of periods of overtime in a single pay cycle.

The 'plain English' model TOIL term

16. On 24 April 2016, a Full Bench of the Commission issued a further decision² in the proceedings dealing with the form of the proposed model TOIL term.

4

² [2016] FWCFB 2602

17. Attachment B to the Full Bench decision of 24 April 2016 sets out a modified, plain English version of the term:

A.1 Time off instead of payment for overtime

- (a) An employee and employer may agree in writing to the employee taking time off instead of being paid for a particular amount of overtime that has been worked by the employee.
- (b) Any amount of overtime that has been worked by an employee in a particular pay period and that is to be taken as time off instead of the employee being paid for it must be the subject of a separate agreement under clause A.1.
- (c) An agreement must state each of the following:
- (i) the number of overtime hours to which it applies and when those hours were worked;
- (ii) that the employer and employee agree that the employee may take time off instead of being paid for the overtime;
- (iii) that, if the employee requests at any time, the employer must pay the employee, for overtime covered by the agreement but not taken as time off, at the overtime rate applicable to the overtime when worked;
- (iv) that any payment mentioned in subparagraph (iii) must be made in the pay period immediately following the request.

Note: An example of the type of TOIL agreement required by this clause is set out at Schedule [x]. There is no requirement to use the form of TOIL agreement set out at Schedule [x]. A TOIL agreement can also be made by an exchange of emails between the employee and employer, or by other electronic means.

(d) The period of time off that an employee is entitled to take is the same as the number of overtime hours worked.

EXAMPLE: An employee who worked 2 overtime hours is entitled to time off of 2 hours.

- (e) Time off must be taken:
- (i) within the period of 6 months after the overtime is worked; and
- (ii) at a time or times within that period of 6 months agreed by the employee and employer.
- (f) If the employee requests at any time, to be paid for overtime covered by an agreement under clause A.1 but not taken as time off, the employer must pay the

employee for the overtime, in the pay period immediately following the request, at the overtime rate applicable to the overtime when worked.

- (g) If time off for overtime that has been worked is not taken within the period of 6 months mentioned in paragraph (e), the employer must pay the employee for the overtime, in the pay period immediately following those 6 months, at the overtime rate applicable to the overtime when worked.
- (h) The employer must keep a copy of any agreement under clause A.1 as an employee record.
- (i) An employer must not exert undue influence or undue pressure on an employee to make, or not make, an agreement under clause A.1.
- (j) An employee may, under section 65 of the Fair Work Act, request to take time off, at a time or times specified in the request or to be subsequently agreed by the employer and the employee, instead of being paid for overtime worked by the employee. Clause A.1 applies to any such time off granted by the employer as if it were time off covered by an agreement under clause A.1.

Note: If an employee makes a request under section 65 of the Fair Work Act for a change in working arrangements, the employer may only refuse that request on reasonable business grounds (see section 65(5) of the Fair Work Act).

(k) If, on the termination of the employee's employment, time off for overtime worked by the employee to which clause A.1 applies has not been taken, the employer must pay the employee for the overtime at the overtime rate applicable to the overtime when worked.

Note: Under section 345(1) of the Fair Work Act, a person must not knowingly or recklessly make a false or misleading representation about the workplace rights of another person under clause A.1.

Comments on the proposed plain English model term

- 18. The NFF cautions against the making of changes to the wording of modern awards, which are legal instruments that determine workplace rights and responsibilities. Even the smallest changes can have inadvertent consequences, and in many cases these will not be known until a later time when a claim arises in relation to the modern award.
- 19. Some instances where there is potential for change in meaning include:
 - (a) the use of examples which create potential to misstate the legal position or to misrepresent it to the reader;
 - (b) where key elements of a term are unintentionally lost in translation (such as proposed clause (e) of the model term, which does not deal with the amount of

time to be taken in the same way as clause (c) of the October 2015 model term does);

- (c) where the effect of a term is narrowed in scope (such as proposed clause (i) of the plain English version of the term).
- 20. The word "notwithstanding" may be considered archaic and no longer appropriate for inclusion in modern awards. However, the word has a particular legal meaning and affects how the interaction of particular terms is construed. It should be replaced (for example, with 'despite') rather than removed entirely.
- 21. In some respects, the plain English model term is more complex than the original term. In our view, this outcome should be avoided and the original wording retained if simpler and easier to understand.
- 22. As an overarching comment, replacing the words "in lieu" with the words "instead" means that the abbreviation "TOIL" is no longer correct. This abbreviation is also used throughout the term and in the proposed template "TOIL Agreement". The change may create confusion among stakeholders familiar with the term TOIL, which is a generally well understood concept. Payroll systems which currently use the expression TOIL on payslips will require adjustment and this will create an administrative burden on business.
- 23. The attached table provides a detailed summary of our views on the proposed plain English model TOIL term.
- 24. Finally, while we appreciate the opportunity to comment on the proposed model term, we note that no decision has yet been made in relation to time off in lieu provisions in the Horticulture Award 2010 and the Pastoral Award 2010. This submission should not be taken as indicating our support for any change to either modern award.

Sarah McKinnon

General Manager, Workplace Relations & Legal Affairs

23 May 2016

Summary of NFF comments in relation to the proposed plain English model TOIL term

October 2015 model term	April 2016 model term	NFF Comment
1. Time off in lieu of payment	A.1 Time off instead of payment	"in lieu" replaced with "instead"
for overtime	for overtime	– can no longer use term TOIL
1.1 An employee may elect with	(a) An employee and employer	Plain English term introduces
the consent of the employer to	may agree in writing to the	new concepts to the introductory
take time off in lieu of payment	employee taking time off instead	para:
for overtime at a time or times	of being paid for a particular	•
agreed with the employer, in	amount of overtime that has been	- Must be in writing;
accordance with this clause.	worked by the employee.	 Agreement must be for a particular amount of overtime; Does not deal with when the time off can be taken (moved to (e)(ii))
1.2 The following requirements apply to time off in lieu of payment for overtime:		Removed
(a) A separate written agreement	(b) Any amount of overtime that	The plain English term is more
must be made by the employee	has been worked by an employee	complex than the original term.
and employer for each occasion	in a particular pay period and that	Suggest as follows:
on which overtime that has been	is to be taken as time off instead	
worked is to be taken as time off	of the employee being paid for it	A separate written agreement
in lieu.	must be the subject of a separate	must be made by the employee
	agreement under clause A.1.	and employer for each pay period during which time off is taken instead of payment for overtime.
Each such agreement must be	(c) An agreement must state each	Opening line moved to (h) in
retained as an employee record	of the following:	plain English term
and must:		
	(i) the number of overtime	(iv) should specify that it is the
(i) state when the employee	hours to which it applies and	'employee's request', as follows:
started and ceased working the	when those hours were	
overtime hours;	worked;	(iv) that any payment mentioned
	(*) 4 (4 1 1 1	in subparagraph (iii) must be
(ii) state that the employee and	(ii) that the employer and employee agree that the	made in the pay period
employer agree that the employee may take time off in	employee agree that the employee may take time off	immediately following the <i>employee's</i> request.
lieu of payment for the	instead of being paid for the	emproyee's request.
overtime; and	overtime;	
,	,	
(iii) include a note in the	(iii) that, if the employee	
following terms:	requests at any time, the	
	employer must pay the	
'If requested by the employee at	employee, for overtime	
any time, the employer must pay	covered by the agreement but	
the employee for any accrued	not taken as time off, at the	
entitlement to take time off in		
lieu of payment for overtime		

October 2015 model term	April 2016 model term	NFF Comment
which the employee has not yet used. Payment must be made at the overtime rate applying to the overtime worked and must be made in the next pay period following the request.'	overtime rate applicable to the overtime when worked; (iv) that any payment mentioned in subparagraph (iii) must be made in the pay period immediately following the request. Note: An example of the type of TOIL agreement required by this clause is set out at Schedule [x]. There is no requirement to use the form of TOIL agreement set out at Schedule [x]. A TOIL agreement can also be made by an exchange of emails between the employee and employer, or by other electronic means. (d) The period of time off that an	Reference to TOIL will need to be removed in the Note and in the proposed Schedule. The plain English term is more
during ordinary time hours shall be taken at the ordinary time rate; that is, an hour for each overtime hour worked.	employee is entitled to take is the same as the number of overtime hours worked. EXAMPLE: An employee who worked 2 overtime hours is	complex than the original term and could result in a change of meaning. Suggest leaving as is, perhaps replacing "ordinary time rate" with "ordinary hourly rate" or equivalent term used in the relevant modern award. As the entitlement only operates where there is agreement, this
	entitled to time off of 2 hours.	should be reflected in the example if it is to be included: EXAMPLE: An employee who worked 2 overtime hours can agree to take 2 hours' time off.
(c) The time to be taken off in lieu of overtime must be agreed between the employee and employer and must be taken within six months of the overtime being worked. Otherwise, payment for the overtime must be made to the employee at overtime rates in the next pay period after that six month period.	 (e) Time off must be taken: (i) within the period of 6 months after the overtime is worked; and (ii) at a time or times within that period of 6 months agreed by the employee and employer. 	The plain English version of this clause does not deal with the amount of time to be taken, and it is not necessary to always refer to "the/that period of 6 months". Suggest rewording: (e) The agreed amount of time off must be taken: (i) at a time or times agreed
		between the employee and employer; and (ii) within 6 months of the overtime being worked.

October 2015 model town	April 2016 model town	NEE Commont
October 2015 model term (d) Notwithstanding any other	April 2016 model term	NFF Comment While the word
provision of clause 1.2, if	(f) If the employee requests at any time, to be paid for overtime	'nothwithstanding' may be
requested by an employee at any	covered by an agreement under	considered archaic, it does have
time, the employer must pay the	clause A.1 but not taken as time	legal meaning. To avoid
employee for any accrued	off, the employer must pay the	potentially inadvertent
entitlement to take time off in	employee for the overtime, in the	consequences from its omission,
lieu of payment for overtime	pay period immediately following	consideration could be given to
which the employee has not yet	the request, at the overtime rate	replacing the term with the term
used. Payment must be made at	applicable to the overtime when	"despite".
the overtime rate applying to the	worked.	despite.
overtime worked and must be	Worked.	
made in the next pay period		
following the request for		
payment.		
Second sentence of (c) above:	(g) If time off for overtime that	
(,,	has been worked is not taken	
Otherwise, payment for the	within the period of 6 months	
overtime must be made to the	mentioned in paragraph (e), the	
employee at overtime rates in	employer must pay the employee	
the next pay period after that six	for the overtime, in the pay period	
month period.	immediately following those 6	
1	months, at the overtime rate	
	applicable to the overtime when	
	worked.	
	(h) The employer must keep a	Note relocation from 1.2(a) to
	copy of any agreement under	stand alone clause.
	clause A.1 as an employee record.	
1.4 An employer must not exert	(i) An employer must not exert	The plain English version of this
undue influence or undue	undue influence or undue pressure	clause is narrower scope than the
pressure on an employee in	on an employee to make, or not	October 2015 model term.
relation to a decision by the	make, an agreement under clause	
employee to make, or not make,	A.1.	
an agreement to take time off in		
lieu of payment for overtime.	(*) A 1 1	A .1 A 1 C . 1
1.3 An employee who is entitled	(j) An employee may, under	As the Act is a defined term in
to request a change in working	section 65 of the Fair Work Act,	all modern awards, it does not
arrangements under section 65	request to take time off, at a time or times specified in the request or	need to be referenced in full.
of the Fair Work Act 2009 may	1 1	The words "es if it were time off
make a request under that section for time off in lieu of	to be subsequently agreed by the employer and the employee,	The words "as if it were time off
payment for overtime at a time	instead of being paid for overtime	covered by an agreement under" could be removed,
or times specified in the request	worked by the employee. Clause	given that despite the request
or at a time or times to be	A.1 applies to any such time off	being made under section 65, it
subsequently agreed with the	granted by the employer as if it	will also be covered by a written
employer. This clause will apply	were time off covered by an	agreement under proposed
to such time off in lieu. Pursuant	agreement under clause A.1.	clause.
to section 65(5) of the Fair		
Work Act 2009, the employer		
may refuse such a request only		
on reasonable business grounds.		
	Note: If an employee makes a	As above, the Act is a defined
	request under section 65 of	term and does not need to be
	the Fair Work Act for a change in	referenced in full. The word

October 2015 model term	April 2016 model term	NFF Comment
	working arrangements, the	"only" appears before the word
	employer may only refuse that	"on" in section 65(5) of the Act.
	request on reasonable business	
	grounds (see section 65(5) of	
	the Fair Work Act).	
(e) If, upon termination of	(k) If, on the termination of the	The phrase "applicable to the
employment, an employee has	employee's employment, time off	overtime when worked" is
an accrued entitlement to take	for overtime worked by the	slightly different to the phrase
time off in lieu of payment for	employee to which clause A.1	"applying to the overtime
overtime which the employee	applies has not been taken, the	worked" and could inadvertently
has not yet used, the employee	employer must pay the employee	change meaning if construed to
must be paid for the overtime at	for the overtime at the overtime	introduce a new 'point in time'
the overtime rate applying to the	rate applicable to the overtime	element to the clause.
overtime worked.	when worked.	
Note: Under s.345 of the Fair	Note: Under section 345(1) of the	
Work Act 2009, a person must	Fair Work Act, a person must not	
not knowingly or recklessly	knowingly or recklessly make a	
make a false or misleading	false or misleading representation	
representation about an	about the workplace rights of	
employee's workplace rights	another person under clause A.1.	
under this award clause.		